

# EXTERNAL REVIEW REPORT

University of Montana  
Office of Career Services

November 2007

## **Review Team**

Stan Inman

Richard Rapp

*CAREER SERVICES*  
*UNIVERSITY OF MONTANA*  
EXTERNAL REVIEW  
NOVEMBER 7-10, 2007

## **Introduction**

A comprehensive review and assessment of The Office of Career Services (OCS) at the University of Montana (UM) was completed by external reviewers Stan Inman, Director of Career Services, University of Utah and Richard “Dick” Rapp, Associate Vice President for Student Affairs/Director of Career Services (Emeritus), Boise State University November 7 – 9 utilizing the Professional Standards of the National Association of Colleges and Employers (NACE).

The external reviewers were provided in advance of the on-campus visit relevant documents in printed form or via web access including The OCS Self Study Report (Evaluation Report OCS 2006-01, June 30, 2006), Strategic Planning Sessions Report and Action Items January 3, 2007 Meeting Minutes, Comparative Data Analysis Report: Career Services at the University of Montana vs. National Association of Colleges and Employers Benchmark Survey, University Catalog, organization charts, UM view book, budget information, and other statistical and budgetary data.

The team utilized the ***Evaluation Workbook, Professional Standards for Colleges and University Career Services 2006***, developed by the National Association of Colleges and Employers. The complete scoring for the 258 evaluated from the 273 individual rating standards in that report is included in Appendix A.

The on-campus review included the team meeting with relevant stakeholders. Appendix B, Career Services External Review Team Itinerary, provides the on-campus itinerary and lists those interviewed by the reviewers.

## **FINDINGS AND RECOMENDATIONS**

In spite of the resources available and limitations resulting from being located distant from a major metropolitan area OCS provides quality career services to the UM. While there are areas identified in this review that require further attention there are many more where OCS excels. The staff is well qualified, dedicated, creative, highly motivated, productive and well managed. The physical facilities, while inadequate in amount, are well arranged and professional and inviting in appearance. OCS is supported well in technology. OCS offers comprehensive and quality programs. The team was especially impressed with a genuine commitment for continuous improvement and the comprehensive operational and evaluative documentation developed and utilized by the OCS team. Overall, UM has every reason to be proud of OCS.

## **Mission**

During the past year OCS reviewed and revised the department's mission statement. It conforms to the University Mission Statement and effectively communicates the role of OCS at UM.

## **Program Components**

The team was impressed by the quality and comprehensive nature of the programs provided by OCS. Our observations were confirmed by our interviews with the constituencies served by OCS. While the students, employers, student service professionals and a majority of academic representatives had glowing comments about the services and the collaboration with other stake holders the team did become aware of some strains in collaborative relationships with a few representatives of academic divisions and departments.

## **Career Advising/Counseling**

OCS has a quality and dedicated staff who provide excellent assistance for students to explore career options in both individual and group settings. Interviewees frequently shared not only how much assistance was provided but the caring nature of the staff providing that help. It is apparent that OCS is proactive in reaching out to not only students but to parents as well. Comments were made about the enthusiastic and worthwhile contributions OCS makes to the UM orientation program. Unfortunately the extent and quality of these services are being jeopardized by insufficient staffing. The demand for these services is at the tipping point of eroding the quality of service.

We were troubled, however, that UM students are not as well served in exploration of career options through internships and cooperative education since responsibility for coordination of internships and cooperative education is assigned by the university to a separate department.

## **Career Information**

OCS is very effective in providing Career Information to its various constituencies.

## **Employment Services**

Given staffing resource limitations OCS has a strong and successful program. UM faces extra challenges from not being located near major employment centers. Through creative and persistent efforts and plain hard work OCS does an admirable job of connecting UM students and graduates with employment opportunities not easily accessed from Missoula, Montana.

## **Experiential Education**

The UM has an experiential program. However, since cooperative education and internship functions report to a separate department the team did not make a comprehensive review of those functions. The team is concerned that the impact of this UM organizational decision may be to diminish the effectiveness of both departments through duplication of services and inefficient use of resources. While universities may distinguish the functions of these two offices because of the academic component of

internships and cooperative education experiences, employers do not. It is common for employers recruiting on campus to include interviews for both internship positions and career positions on the same recruiting schedule. Increasingly employers are utilizing these experiences as one of their main, if not their main, method of recruiting career employees. To them having to deal with multiple departments creates confusion and needless bureaucracy. The students we interviewed also mentioned confusion caused by the division of these functions. Over the last 20 years the vast majority of institutions have moved these functions into their career services department for these reasons.

### **Graduate School Services**

OCS could do more in providing graduate and professional school information to students. While some assistance is provided it appears to have a fairly low priority. Staffing level may well account for this. As indicated above staffing resources, especially for counseling and advising assistance is severely stretched. Should staffing resources become available OCS should consider offering a special Graduate and Professional School Fair. Graduate and Professional Schools are presently included in the Career Fair. A more focused event would likely draw more participation by both these programs and by interested students. Increasingly we are seeing such an event at comparable institutions. Many institutions have discovered that their own graduate programs benefit from this exposure since surprisingly students are not always aware of the availability and the quality of programs at their own institution. Other schools have also found benefits for their own programs from inviting community members to this event as well.

### **Program Management**

The review team saw this as one of the major strengths of OCS at UM. The ongoing effort to critically evaluate every facet of the program and to actively engage in continual improvement was notable. The team was also struck by the immense amount of comprehensive documentation of these activities which is often lacking on other campuses.

### **Organization**

Overall OCS was found to be well organized to conduct its business. One concern in this regard was the question of "chain of command". It was unclear to the team and in our interviews it appeared to be unclear to stakeholders who is in charge when the Director is unavailable. Consideration of designating a staff position as Assistant or Associate Director should be considered. Creating this position would also result in having an additional opportunity for possible advancement in addition to the Director position.

### **Human Resources**

After careful observation, staff interviews, and a review of reported student statistics, it is clear that the quality, experience, and competence of the OCS staff is exceptional. The OCS is functioning at an extremely high level. However, it is evident that increasing student counseling loads have placed the OCS very close to a threshold of capacity. Clearly, they could benefit from additional professional counseling staff.

Currently, OCS has 2.5 FTE of dedicated professional staff (0.5 of this FTE resides in the College of Technology). OCS reports that the number of student requests for counseling appointments has steady increased over the past 3 years. They recorded 1829 student counseling appointments in '06 – '07. When comparing data of student counseling appointments (non drop-in, developmental counseling visits), to the NACE benchmark survey for institutions of similar enrollments, the OCS is well over the average number of reported student counseling appointments in the NACE survey (1486). This high demand for services, compounded by only 2.5 FTE is a critical area of concern for the OCS that should to be addressed quickly. Even though current physical space limitations present an obvious difficulty in adding new staff, it will remain a priority for the continued success of the OCS. Taking into consideration the load of student appointments and limited counseling staff, OCS provides both responsive and outstanding level of service. One additional note of concern is staff salaries may not provide adequate incentive for continued service to OCS. We make a strong recommendation to review staff compensation with similar positions at peer institutions and work toward more equity in compensation for professional staff members.

Staffing of OCS does not include any non-Caucasian representation. Though recruitment for diversity is challenging at UM given salaries and location OCS should be persistent in achieving staff diversity as positions become available. Recruitment should especially be focused on diversity representative of UM student demographics.

On the whole, personnel in OCS rate very high in areas of planning, staff development and supervision. However, the team did find several difficult relationship issues with one academic area (Business) that will be very difficult to resolve. Though OCS recognizes these issues and has worked to get them resolved it will require extraordinary political sensitivity and negotiation skills to make any headway here.

Given staffing and other resource limitations OCS provides and effectively conducts a broad menu of successful programs and events. The one area for improvement identified was to give increased attention to involvement and communications with academic areas in planning and scheduling career fair events.

OCS maintains a strong focus on assessing UM student needs and providing appropriate programming and consistently surveys students on their assessment of programs and services provided.

OCS provides high quality career advising/counseling and consultation. During the team's interviews both students and faculty were high in their praise of OCS staff in this regard. The limiting factor here is staff level. Given the growing demand from students it is only a matter of time before they begin expressing frustration with access to these important services.

The team was surprised to discover that two separate systems are being employed for listing career and for student employment. We understand that this is by design to make the student employment system open to the general population and not password protected (admissions uses it while recruiting potential students to show them that they can find work at UM). The team suggests that OCS review how other institutions have worked this out using a single system to determine if there is a way to provide limited access without compromising the system. While both systems work well they result in

redundancies which likely add to system management time and possibly confuse employers and students. One student commented on this issue and questioned the benefit of separate systems. A major advantage of using a single system is that students only need to learn one system and have a seamless transition as they begin to look for career employment.

The team reviewed the resumes and job descriptions of OCS staff. Staff are well-qualified for their positions and job descriptions appear complete and current. The team did not, however, find written job descriptions for student employees and recommends that these positions also have written descriptions.

### **Facilities and Equipment and Technology**

In spite of resource limitations OCS appears to have excellent technological and equipment resources. The resources available on the OCS website are comprehensive, user friendly and current. Staff has adequate access to technology. The resource area appears to be heavily used and provides good access for students. The video resources in the resource area are outstanding.

Unfortunately there are a few facilities issues. There is no area reasonably close for employers to take a break or get refreshments or lunch. Parking presents a serious obstacle for employers being neither adequate nor convenient. The number of interview rooms is minimally adequate and with any growth in that function or increase in staffing will be seriously inadequate.

### **Campus and External Relations**

The majority of areas of the campus gave high marks to OCS for programs, services and cooperation. During these interviews we heard high praise for OCS. They frequently commented on the quality and dedication of OCS staff, the quality of programs and that they had received very positive feedback on OCS from both students and employers.

There was, however, a notable exception which provides a challenge for OCS and will need to be addressed. This is not uncommon on a university campus. There appears to be a growing trend among some professional schools on many campuses to see their needs as separate and paramount resulting in unrealistic expectations in some cases and an interest in creating their own career services office in others. While the team did not hear any plans of the latter at UM there was certainly some of the former expressed by Business along with some likely legitimate communication issues. It is essential that campus leaders recognize the value of a career services office committed to benefit all programs and students. It is also important to recognize (as OCS does) that students in professional programs will sometimes want to explore career options outside traditional careers pursued by most in their programs. For example, an accounting major may decide to go into social service. While OCS needs to continue to be proactive in trying to resolve these relationship issues, it is unlikely that they will be addressed satisfactorily without intervention and assistance from both academic and student affairs leadership/administration.

In addition there were some issues raised by Pharmacy regarding communications related to the timing of the Accounting and Health Professions Career Fair and coordination with other fairs in the region. The team learned that OCS was already addressing those concerns.

### **Employer Relations**

OCS has comprehensive and appropriate policies, practices and procedures for employer relations and services. Employers expressed high satisfaction with the services provided to them by UM.

### **Legal/Equal Opportunity, Access, Access, Affirmative Action, and Diversity/Ethics Responsibilities**

OCS staff is very knowledgeable and conscientious in legal and ethical responsibilities. Like many other campuses they face the challenge of faculty and staff outside their department occasionally employing questionable practices. Their ability to correct these instances is limited since they lack clear authority to take action in such cases.

### **Program Evaluation, Assessment, and Research**

As mentioned previously, the team found comprehensive assessment of programs and services including statistical participation data and evaluations. Outcomes research and evidence of client learner outcomes is being done on a limited scale. Though challenging, increased efforts in this important area is warranted.

### **SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS**

- Academic and Student Affairs leadership need to agree and clarify the preeminent leadership role of OCS in career guidance and employer relations at the U of M.
- Strong consideration should be given to moving the cooperative education and internship function to OCS.
- Designate a staff position of OCS as Assistant or Associate Director.
- Add a minimum of 1 FTE professional counseling staff.
- Review professional staff compensation with similar positions at peer institutions and work toward bringing salaries in line with the findings.
- Persistent efforts should be made to focus recruitment of any new openings in OCS on enhancing diversity representative of UM student demographics.
- Develop job descriptions for student positions in OCS.
- Consider offering a separate graduate and professional school fair event.
- Give increased attention to involvement and communication with academic areas in planning and scheduling career fair events.

- Increase assessment programs which evaluate student outcomes from programs and services provided by OCS.
- Explore the advantages of moving to a single system for employment listings.
- Continue efforts to find a solution to providing an employer lounge and for adequate and convenient parking for employers coming to OCS.
- Give a high priority to adding at least two office spaces in OCS to address staffing and interview room needs.

## **FINAL REMARKS**

The Peer Review team was impressed by the candor and sincerity of everyone we met with during our visit to the University of Montana. We especially commend the Office of Career Services for their commitment to this evaluation process and willingness to expose themselves to the stresses it invariably entails. UM and OCS can rightfully be proud of the career services provided to UM students and alumni. While it is tempting to focus on the critical remarks in this report it is important to understand that, on the whole, OCS provides quality services and programs to UM.

We appreciated the wonderful hospitality provided us during our visit and hope that this report is useful in continuing to advance career services at the University of Montana.



APPENDIX A  
**EVALUATION WORKBOOK**  
*Professional Standards for Colleges and University Career Services*  
*National Association of Colleges and Employers*

## Introduction

## Background

The use of professional standards in career services is intended to facilitate excellence in the creation, maintenance, and delivery of programs and services. Professionally derived standards, representing the perspectives of diverse practitioners, and promulgated under the aegis of a professional association, provide an exceptional opportunity for practitioners to engage in processes of self-assessment and self-regulation that are internally motivated and directed.

The philosophical position in developing the NACE Professional Standards for College and University Career Services was that good methodologies:

- promote self-assessment and self-regulation initiatives using professional standards as key factors in fostering improvement in programs, services, and processes;
- include qualitative as well as quantitative approaches;
- lead to internal improvement;
- encourage methodical, meticulous, and reliable collection and presentation of information that will provide evidence of quality, and promote analysis and synthesis of information; and
- demonstrate external and internal accountability;
- honor institutional uniqueness and recognize that information is not always comparable across institutions because of differences in location and local economic conditions; student characteristics, abilities, and preparation; variety and quality of academic programs; and missions of the institutions and their career services offices. Any analysis of data must include explanations of such qualifiers. The NACE Professional Standards for College and University Career Services was written broadly to reflect variations in career services provided by individual colleges and universities.

## Purpose

This workbook is designed to be used as a companion to the NACE Professional Standards for College and University Career Services for those who wish to evaluate their program against the standards. Each professional standard represents best practices for career services and is defined broadly to allow for variation among institutions and career services offices. The standards reflect dimensions of career services that affect program performance and quality.

Each of the professional standards is considered to be extremely important and reflects recommended program components or functions for career services. Many of the standards may be considered absolutely essential by an individual career services office.

The standards were written to reflect an institution's responsibilities for career services. Some program components may be provided by the institution in a department other than career services. Individual career services offices may not have responsibility for certain programs or services identified as career services within these professional standards; however, the institution does bear final responsibility for delivery of career services, in whatever fashion they are administered within the institution. Evaluators may be required to collect and evaluate data from several different offices at an institution in order to conduct a thorough evaluation.

The standards pertain to career services units, programs, and services, not staff members. They reflect dimensions of career services that affect program performance and quality. To localize the standards, individual institutions and career service offices should provide specific examples or documentation of how they are meeting or not meeting each applicable standard.

This workbook is divided into sections containing self-assessment criterion measures that generally follow the sequence of items in the standards document. In some cases, the standards document contains additional information to provide better context for the reader. Please note that some criteria may apply to several functional areas within career services and that overlap does exist.

## Scoring

The standards and self-assessment criteria pertain to career services units, not to individual staff members.

While these self-assessment criterion measures broadly reflect career services programs and services, not every criterion measure will apply to every institution or career services office.

However, each criterion should

be addressed and responses will include a numerical rating or a notation that it is not being evaluated.

A 3-point rating scale is used to judge how well each criterion measure meets the NACE standards:

1 = Standard is not met at all or in any appreciable manner.

2 = Partially meets standard.

3 = Fully meets standard.

N/E = Not evaluated. Standard does not apply to this institution and/or career services office.

## Evaluation Workbook Section I: Mission

### I. MISSION Rating

1. Career services supports the mission, academic programs, and advancement of the institution. **3**
2. Career services assists students and other designated clients in developing, evaluating, and/or implementing career, education, and employment decisions and plans. **3**
3. Career services helps individuals to develop self-knowledge related to career choice and work performance by identifying, assessing, and understanding their competencies, interests, values, and personal characteristics. **3**
4. Career services helps individuals obtain educational and occupational information to aid their career and educational planning and to develop their understanding of the world of work. **3**
5. Career services helps individuals select personally suitable academic programs and experiential opportunities that optimize their future educational and employment options. **3**
6. Career services helps individuals take responsibility for developing their career decisions, graduate/professional school plans, employment plans, and/or job-search competencies. **3**
7. Career services helps individuals prepare to find suitable employment by developing job-search skills, effective candidate presentation skills, and an understanding of the fit between their competencies and occupational requirements. **3**
8. The institution helps individuals gain career-related experience through student activities, community service, student employment, research projects, cooperative education, internships and other opportunities. **3**
9. Career services helps individuals link with alumni, employers, professional organizations, and others who will provide them with opportunities to develop professional interests and competencies, integrate academic learning with work, and explore future career possibilities. **3**
10. Career services helps individuals seek a desired employment opportunity or entry into an appropriate educational, graduate, or professional program. **3**
11. Career services helps individuals prepare to manage their careers after graduation. **3**
12. Career services considers the needs of all students and other clients of the institution

in designing and delivering programs and services. **3**

13. Career services provides linkages and/or coordination among career-related programs and services where appropriate. **3**

14. Career services communicates its mission as appropriate to administrators, faculty, staff, and other appropriate institutional constituencies. **3**

Scoring - Section I

Number of Items = 14 Possible Score = **42**

Number of Applicable Items = **14**

Actual Score = **42**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

**COMMENTS: *OCS reviewed and updated the formal mission statement during the past year following a comprehensive self-study. The office fully complies and in some cases exceeds the overall mission standards developed by NACE.***

## **Evaluation Workbook Section II: Program Components**

### II. PROGRAM COMPONENTS Rating

15. The key program components of the career services function are designed, clearly defined, and implemented in alignment with:

a. the career development needs and academic and occupational interests of students and other clients; **3**

b. current research, theories, and knowledge of career development and learning; **3**

c. contemporary career services practices; **3**

d. economic trends, opportunities, and/or constraints; **3**

e. institutional priorities; **3**

f. resources. **3**

16. Career services works collaboratively with academic divisions, departments, individual faculty members, student services, employers, and other relevant constituencies of the institution to enhance students' career development. **2**

17. Career services promotes career development for students as integral to the mission of the institution. **3**

18. Career services staff provide information on programs and services through institutional print and electronic publications, campus media, presentations, outreach, and orientation programs. **3**

19. Career services provides information on career and employment topics and the ethical obligations of students, employers, and others involved in the employment process. **3**

Scoring - Section II

Number of Items =10 Possible Score = 30

Number of Applicable Items = 10

Actual Score = **29**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.9**

**COMMENTS: *Item II.16. While the collaboration with student services, employers and most faculty and academic divisions and departments is excellent there are some strains in relationships with a few faculty, and academic divisions which are discussed in the narrative.***

### II-A. Career Advising/Counseling Rating

20. The institution provides career advising/counseling to assist students at any stage of their college experience while they are enrolled in the institution. **3**

21. Career services assists students with career issues relevant to the individual, e.g., dual careers, sexual orientation, disabilities, and so forth. **3**

22. Career services helps students obtain and research occupational, educational, and

employment information. **3**

23. Career services helps students establish short-term and long-term career goals. **3**

24. Career services helps students explore career options through internships, shadowing experiences, summer and part-time jobs, cooperative education, and/or other career-related activities. **2**

25. Career services helps students make career choices based on accurate self-knowledge and information about the world of work. **3**

26. Career services offers career advising/counseling in order to link students' career decision making with access to employers and employment information. **3**

27. Career services encourages students to take advantage of career services as early as possible in their academic programs. **3**

28. Career services provides career advising/counseling through scheduled appointments with individuals, group programs, career planning courses, outreach opportunities, special events, information technology, and/or other available resources. **3**

29. Career services refers students to other counseling and resource agencies if assistance is needed beyond the scope of career advising/counseling. **3**

30. Career services helps students explore careers through part-time employment and experiential education programs. **3**

31. Career services maintains appropriate records for future work with students. **3**

Scoring - Subsection II-A

Number of Items = 12 Possible Score = 36

Number of Applicable Items = 12

Actual Score = **35**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.9**

**COMMENTS: *Item II-A.24. OCS provides excellent help for students to explore career options. However OCS is limited in assisting exploration of career options through internships and cooperative education since responsibility for coordination of internships and cooperative education is assigned by the university to a separate department.***

***Item II-A.27. Several comments were made to the team regarding the enthusiastic and quality participation by OCS staff in orientation of new students***

#### II-B. Career Information Rating

32. Career services makes current and comprehensive career information accessible to students as they explore and make career decisions. **3**

33. Career services provides resources to help students assess and relate their interests, competencies, needs, expectations, education, experience, personal background, and desired lifestyle to the employment market. **3**

34. Career services provides information on current and projected employment opportunities and on employers to ensure that candidates have the widest possible choices of employment. **3**

35. Career services provides information on graduate and professional academic programs and other continuing education programs. **3**

36. Career services uses information technology to give students and staff access to the Internet and other computer resources. **3**

37. Career information is conveniently available in a variety of media appropriate for different learning styles and special needs. **3**

38. Career information resources are accessible and organized with an appropriate system that is user-friendly, flexible, and adaptable to change. **3**

39 Career information facilities are staffed with persons who have the appropriate counseling, advising, and information technology competencies to assist students in accessing and using career information. **3**

40. The following categories of career information are available through career services:

a. self-assessment and career planning; **3**

b. occupational and job market information; **3**

- c. graduate and professional schools; **2**
- d. employment/job search; **3**
- e. job, experiential education, and internship listings; **3**
- f. employer information. **3**

Scoring - Subsection II-B

Number of Items = 14 Possible Score = 42

Number of Applicable Items = 14

Actual Score = **41**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.9**

**COMMENTS: *Item II-B.40.c. While graduate and professional school information is available through OCS it appears to have a fairly low priority. One consideration might be to hold a separate graduate school fair event providing an opportunity for interested students to meet with representatives of graduate and professional schools as is increasingly done on other campuses.***

#### II-C. Employment Services Rating

- 41. Career services assists students in exploring a full range of career and work possibilities that match their career goals. **3**
- 42. Career services assists students in preparing and developing job-search competencies and tools to present themselves effectively as candidates for employment. **3**
- 43. Career services assists students in obtaining information on employment opportunities and prospective employers. **3**
- 44. Career services assists students in connecting with employers through campus interviews, job listings, referrals, direct application, networking, job-search events, publications, and/or information technology. **3**
- 45. Career services develops and maintains relationships with employers that provide career development and employment opportunities for students. **3**

Scoring - Subsection II-C

Number of Items = 5 Possible Score = 15

Number of Applicable Items = 5

Actual Score = **15**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

**COMMENTS: *OCS has a strong and successful commitment to providing comprehensive employment services to the UM.***

#### II-D. Experiential Education Rating

- 46. The institution provides experiential education programs that include student employment and/or cooperative education, work-based learning, apprenticeships, internships, volunteer jobs, service learning, and shadowing experiences. **3\***
- 47. Career services provides, or works closely with other departments that provide, experiential education opportunities. **3**
- 48. Experiential education programs help students obtain career-related experiences with organizations that provide adequate supervision and opportunities for students to reflect upon their learning and career development. **3**

Scoring - Subsection II-D:

Number of Items = 3 Possible Score = 9

Number of Applicable Items = 3

Actual Score = **9\***

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3\***

**COMMENTS: *While the "institution" provides experiential education programs internships and cooperative education functions report to a separate department. The impact of this UM organizational decision is discussed further in the narrative.***

#### II-E. Graduate School Services Rating

49. Career services assists students in identifying graduate or professional school programs that match their career goals. **3**

50. Career services assists students in effectively presenting themselves as graduate/professional school candidates for further study. **3**

51. Career services assists students in obtaining information on graduate/professional school programs through a variety of sources. **3**

52. Career services assists students in connecting with graduate/professional schools through campus interviews, referrals, direct application, events, publications, and/or information technology. **2**

Scoring - Subsection II-E:

Number of Items = 4 Possible Score = 12

Number of Applicable Items = 4

Actual Score = **11**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.75**

COMMENTS: ***Item II-E.52. OCS does not conduct any special event such as a Graduate/Professional School Fair. These programs are included in the Career Fair but that event lacks the focus that might bring more programs to UM.***

### Evaluation Workbook Section III: Program Management

#### III. PROGRAM MANAGEMENT Rating

53. A leader or leadership team manages career services and aligns career services with the mission of the institution and the needs of the constituencies served. **3**

54. Career services leadership has developed a mission statement, program goals and objectives, and strategic and operational plans for fulfilling the purpose of the career services program. **3**

55. Career services reviews and updates its goals annually. **3**

56. Career services staff members conduct regular program evaluations to improve career services operations and to adjust to changing client needs and environmental threats and opportunities. **3**

57. Career services staff regularly review the office's policies, procedures, and budgetary issues. **3**

58. Career services has identified key constituencies, and their needs are reflected in its mission and goals. **3**

59. The services/programs provided by the career services office are defined in terms of their priority. **3**

60. Career services leaders are advocates for the advancement of career-related services within the institution. **3**

Scoring - Section III

Number of Items = 8 Possible Score = 24

Number of Applicable Items = 8

Actual Score = **24**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS: ***This was identified as one of the real strengths of OCS at UM. The team was especially impressed with the thoroughness in meeting these standards and with the documentation confirming these efforts.***

### Evaluation Workbook Section IV: Organization

#### IV. ORGANIZATION Rating

61. The external and internal organization of career services, including its place within the institution, supports its mission. **3**

62. The career services function is organized to develop positive relationships with students; academic, administrative, and student affairs colleagues; employers; and alumni. **3**

63. The external organization, e.g., reporting lines of career services within the college/university, provide optimal visibility and institutional support. **3**

64. The unit to which career services reports allows for efficient and effective delivery of career services within the institution. **3**

65. The internal organization of career services is clearly defined through an organizational chart. **3**

66. Staff titles, roles, and reporting lines support the efficient and effective delivery of career services and programs. **2**

Score - Section IV

Number of Items = 6 Possible Score = 18

Number of Applicable Items = 6

Actual Score = **17**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.8**

**COMMENTS: As mentioned in the narrative, the team recommends that consideration be given to designating a staff member as an Associate Director. The "chain of command" is not clear under the current structure of OCS creating possible issues when the Director is not available.**

## **Evaluation Workbook Section V: Human Resources**

### V. HUMAN RESOURCES Rating

67. Career services has an adequate number of qualified professional and support staff to fulfill its mission and functions. **2**

68. Career services has instituted hiring and promotion practices that are fair, inclusive, and nondiscriminatory. **3**

69. To ensure the existence of suitable and identifiable role models, career services staff diversity reflects and/or is representative of the student population. **2**

70. Career services develops and maintains job descriptions for all staff members and provides regular performance appraisals. **3**

71. Career services has a regular system of staff evaluation and provides access to professional development opportunities. **3**

72. Salaries and benefits for staff are commensurate with similar positions within the institution, in similar institutions, and in the relevant geographic area. **2**

73. Career services staff members are trained in legal, confidential, and ethical issues related to career services. **3**

74. Career services professionals engage in continuing professional development activities to keep abreast of the conditions that affect their work and to develop skills to perform program functions and tasks effectively. **3**

Score - Section V

Number of Items = 8 Possible Score = 24

Number of Applicable Items = 8

Actual Score = **21**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.6**

**COMMENTS: V-67. Staffing is inadequate to fulfill OCS mission and functions based on benchmark comparisons with comparable institutions. See discussion in narrative and recommendations.**

**V-69. There is no non-Caucasian representation on the OCS staff. Recognizing the difficulties of recruiting for diversity given UM salaries, locations and other factors, OCS still needs to be persistent in striving for staff diversity, especially representative of UM student demographics.**

**V-72. Salaries, particularly for Career Counselors are significantly below benchmark comparisons as discussed in narrative and included in recommendations.**

V-A. Functions

Primary program functions and their related core competencies and knowledge domains are defined below. Rate the competencies from a program perspective, not an individual perspective.

75. Career services is staffed by persons who, in combination, possess core competencies to perform the following primary program functions effectively:

V-A1. Management and Administration Rating

- a. Needs assessment and satisfaction measures. **3**
- b. Systematic program design, implementation, and evaluation. **3**
- c. Systematic strategic and operational planning. **3**
- d. Program integration and integrity. **3**
- e. Defined staffing procedures. **3**
- f. Staff development and supervision. **3**
- g. Budget planning and administration. **3**
- h. Political sensitivity and negotiation skills. **2**
- i. Synthesize, interpret, and report current and longitudinal information. **3**

Score - Subsection V-A1

Number of Items = 9 Possible Score = 27

Number of Applicable Items = 9

Actual Score = **26**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.88**

**COMMENTS: V-A1.h. The team detected a troubling relationship issue (Business) that will be extremely difficult to resolve. While it appears that OCS is aware of these issues and has made sincere efforts to resolve them it may require extraordinary political sensitivity and negotiation skills to make meaningful progress.**

V-A2. Program and Event Administration Rating

- a. Needs assessment. **3**
- b. Goal setting. **3**
- c. Program planning, implementation, and evaluation. **2**
- d. Budget allocation. **3**
- e. Time management. **3**
- f. Problem solving. **2**
- g. Attention to detail. **3**

Score - Subsection V-A2

Number of Items = 7 Possible Score = 21

Number of Applicable Items = 7

Actual Score = **19**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.7**

**COMMENTS: V-A2.c and V-A2.f. During the teams conversations with academic divisions comments indicated concerns with scheduling issues regarding events. While it is usually impossible to satisfy all parties it appeared that more involvement by and communication with these areas could reduce some of the complaints.**



V-A3. Research and Student Learning/Development Outcomes Rating

- a. Identification of relevant and desirable student learning and development outcomes. **3**
- b. Outcome-oriented programming. **3**
- c. Research-based evidence of program impact on student learning and development outcomes. **2**

Score - Subsection V-A3

Number of Items = 3 Possible Score = 9

Number of Applicable Items = 3

Actual Score = **8**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.66**

**COMMENTS: V-A3.c. Studies are regularly conducted by OCS of statistical participation and evaluations by participants of program value. However, the team did find limited evidence of studies evaluating learning outcomes. While these studies are often more difficult to design and conduct they are of growing importance and need to be accomplished.**

V-A4. Career Advising/Counseling and Consultation Rating

- a. Client needs assessment and diagnosis. **3**
- b. Client intervention/design and implementation. **3**
- c. Test administration and interpretation. **3**
- d. Counseling skills. **3**
- e. Advising skills. **3**
- f. Client evaluation of counseling services. **3**
- g. Ability to work with individuals. **3**
- h. Ability to work with groups. **3**
- i. Use of career, occupational, and employment information. **3**

Score - Subsection V-A4

Number of Items = 9 Possible Score = 27

Number of Applicable Items = 9

Actual Score = **27**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

**COMMENTS: OCS is outstanding in Career Advising/Counseling and Consultation. This was confirmed by both the team's observations and from comments from students and from faculty.**

V-A5. Teaching/Training/Educating Rating

- a. Population needs assessment to define learning objectives. **3**
- b. Program/workshop design and delivery competencies. **3**
- c. Researching, evaluating, and integrating educational information. **3**
- d. Training/teaching/presenting/public speaking. **3**
- e. Career coaching/career mentoring. **3**
- f. Work with individuals and groups. **3**
- g. Work with diverse populations. **3**
- h. Use of technology for delivery of content. **3**

Score - Subsection V-A5

Number of Items = 8 Possible Score = 24

Number of Applicable Items = 8

Actual Score = **24**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS:

V-A6. Marketing/Promoting/Outreach Rating

- a. Client needs assessment and goal setting. **3**
- b. Written and interpersonal communication; public speaking. **3**
- c. Domestic and international job and experiential learning. **3**
- d. Relationship development and management. **3**
- e. Effective use of print, web, and personal presentation methods. **3**
- f. Sales and closing techniques. **N/E**
- g. Development/fundraising strategies. **3**
- h. Marketing principles/strategies. **3**

Score - Subsection V-A6

Number of Items = 8 Possible Score = 24

Number of Applicable Items = **7**

Actual Score = **21**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS: ***V-A6.f. The team did not have the opportunity to evaluate sales and closing techniques.***

V-A7. Brokering/Connecting/Linking Rating

- a. Organize information, logistics, people, and processes toward a desired outcome. **3**
- b. Consult with clients to improve effectiveness. **3**
- c. Build and manage advisory boards. **N/E**
- d. Effective interpersonal skills. **3**

Score - Subsection V-A7

Number of Items = 4 Possible Score = 12

Number of Applicable Items = **3**

Actual Score = **9**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS:

V-A8. Information Management Rating

- a. Appropriate organization and dissemination of information. **2**
- b. Efficient information storage and retrieval. **3**
- c. Knowledge of computing systems and applications. **3**
- d. Effective data collection and analysis. **3**
- e. Acquisition of appropriate career resources. **3**
- f. Web design and management. **3**

Score - Subsection V-A8

Number of Items = 6 Possible Score = 18

Number of Applicable Items = **6**

Actual Score = **17**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.8**

COMMENTS: ***V-A8.a. Having separate systems for career and for student employment should be carefully reviewed. This appears to result in unnecessary redundancies creating additional system staff management time and sometimes is confusing to students and possibly employers. The advantage of students learning one system should be considered.***

V- B. Position Qualifications/Competencies Rating

V-B1. Leadership by Career Services Managers (Directors, Associate Directors, and Assistant Directors) Rating

- a. The institution appoints, positions, and empowers career services leaders at various levels within the administrative structure to accomplish stated missions. **3**
- b. Career services leaders at various levels are selected on the basis of formal education and training, relevant work experience, personal skills and competencies,

and relevant professional credentials, as well as for their potential for promoting learning and development in students, applying effective practices to educational processes, and enhancing institutional effectiveness. **3**

c. The institution determines expectations of accountability for leaders and fairly assesses their performance. **3**

d. Leaders in the career services unit exercise authority over resources for which they are responsible to achieve their respective missions. **3**

e. Career services leaders:

e1. articulate a vision for their organization **3**

e2. set goals and objectives based on the needs and capabilities of the population served. **3**

e3. promote student learning and development. **3**

e4. prescribe and practice ethical behavior. **3**

e5. recruit, select, supervise, and develop others in the organization. **3**

e6. manage financial resources. **3**

e7. coordinate human resources. **3**

e8. plan, budget for, and evaluate personnel and programs. **3**

e9. apply effective practices to educational and administrative processes. **3**

e10. communicate effectively. **3**

e11. initiate collaborative interaction between individuals and agencies that possess legitimate concerns and interests in the functional area. **2**

f. Career services leaders identify and find means to address individual, organizational, or environmental conditions that inhibit goal achievement. **3**

g. Career services leaders promote campus environments that result in multiple opportunities for student learning and development. **3**

h. Career services leaders continuously improve programs and services in response to changing needs of students and other constituents, and evolving institutional priorities. **3**

i. If career components are offered through multiple units, the institution designates a leader or leadership team to provide strategic direction and align career services with the mission of the institution and the needs of the constituencies served. **2**

j. Career services leaders coordinate efforts with other units in the institution providing career components to integrate career services into the broader educational mission. **2**

k. Key constituencies served by each career services unit are clearly identified and reflected in the mission and goals of the career services unit. **3**

l. Career services leaders are advocates for the advancement of career services within the institution. **3**

m. Career services leaders participate in institutional decisions related to the identification and designation of clients served. **3**

n. Career services leaders participate in decisions regarding type and scope of services offered and the fees, if any, that are charged to clients. **3**

Score - Subsection V-B1

Number of Items = 24 Possible Score = 72

Number of Applicable Items = **24**

Actual Score = **69**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.86**

COMMENTS: ***See the comments under Campus and External Relations (page 6) regarding issues with Business.***

V-B2. Professional Positions (Career Counselors and Advisers, Employer Relations Coordinators, Consultants) Rating

a. Professional staff members hold an earned degree in a field relevant to the position they hold or possess an appropriate combination of educational credentials and related work experience. **3**

b. Professional staff members have the requisite qualifications and competencies to perform effectively in their defined roles with students, alumni, faculty, administrators,

and employers, and in highly specialized functions, such as career and employment counseling, student employment, cooperative education, internships, work-study, graduate school advising, computer technology, etc. **3**

Score - Subsection V-B2

Number of Items = 2 Possible Score = 6

Number of Applicable Items = 2

Actual Score = **6**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS: **OCS staff are highly qualified, competent and effective.**

V-B3. Pre-Professional Positions (Paraprofessionals, Interns, Graduate Assistants) Rating

a. Paraprofessionals, interns, and graduate assistants are carefully selected, trained in helping skills and institutional procedures, closely supervised, and evaluated regularly. **3**

b. Degree or credential-seeking interns are qualified by enrollment in an appropriate field of study and by relevant experience. **3**

c. These individuals are trained and supervised adequately by professional staff members holding educational credentials and related work experience appropriate for supervision. **3**

Score - Subsection V-B3

Number of Items = 3 Possible Score = 9

Number of Applicable Items = 3

Actual Score = **9**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS:

V-B4. Student Employee and/or Volunteer Positions Rating

a. Student employees and volunteers are carefully selected, trained, supervised and evaluated. **3**

b. Student employees and volunteers are trained in how and when to refer those in need of assistance to qualified staff members and have access to a supervisor for assistance in making these judgments. **3**

c. Student employees and volunteers are provided with clear and precise job descriptions, pre-service training based on assessed needs, and continuing staff development; training includes customer service, program procedures, and information and resource utilization. **2**

Score - Subsection V-B3

Number of Items = 3 Possible Score = 9

Number of Applicable Items = 3

Actual Score = **8**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.66**

COMMENTS: **The team did not find written job descriptions for student employees.**

V-B5. Support Staff and Technical Positions Rating Comments

a. Career services has an adequate number of administrative and technical staff to accomplish its mission. **2 No**

b. Career services support and technical staff are technologically proficient and qualified to perform their duties, knowledgeable of ethical and legal uses of technology, and have access to training. **3 Yes**

c. The level of staffing and workload are adequate and appropriate for program and service demands. **2 No**

d. A technical support person or support service is available to maintain computer and information technology systems for career services. **3 Yes**

Scoring - Section V-B5

Number of Items = 4 Possible Score = 12

Number of Applicable Items = 4

Actual Score = **10**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.5**

COMMENTS:

## **Evaluation Workbook Section VI: Facilities and Equipment**

### VI. FACILITIES AND EQUIPMENT Rating

76. Career services has adequate facilities and equipment to perform its functions effectively. **2**

77. Career services has private offices for professional staff to permit them to perform career advising/counseling or other confidential work; support staff work areas; reception and student waiting area; career resource center; storage space sufficient to accommodate supplies and equipment; and necessary office equipment, including computers for staff and student usage. **2**

78. Career services provides students and employers with private interview facilities and adequate conditions and equipment to function professionally. **3**

79. The number of employment interview rooms is adequate to meet employer and student needs. **2**

80. An employer lounge or an accessible lunch area is available. **1**

81. The facility has Internet connectivity and access to conference rooms and large group meeting rooms that have an appropriate level of technology to support service delivery. **3**

82. Sufficient information technology is available for students and staff to support career services functions. **3**

83. Equipment and facilities are secured to protect the confidentiality and safety of records. **3**

84. Facilities are accessible to persons with disabilities and comply with the Americans With Disabilities Act (ADA). **3**

85. Accommodations for students with special needs are provided by career services or in conjunction with the department that serves this population. **3**

86. Career services projects a welcoming, professional atmosphere for students, employers, alumni, parents, and others. **3**

87. Career services provides office hours at times appropriate for its constituencies. **3**

88. Parking for visitors is adequate and convenient. **1**

Scoring - Section VI

Number of Items = 13 Possible Score = 39

Number of Applicable Items = 13

Actual Score = **32**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) =

COMMENTS: **2.46**

## **Evaluation Workbook Section VII: Technology**

### VII. TECHNOLOGY Rating

89. Career services' web sites provide updated information regarding mission, location, staffing, programs, and services available to students as well as contact information. The web site is integrated within the college/university technological infrastructure and include links to appropriate sites both within and external to the institution. **3**

90. Career services' computer-based assessment and computer-assisted career guidance systems support the mission of the career services office. **3**

91. Career services' computer-based and/or online recruiting and employment systems support any career services office mission for part-time employment, cooperative education, internship, and professional employment. These employment systems include online opportunity listings and student resume data bases. **3**

92. Career services offices make informed choices regarding the use of available technological applications to career programs, including systems developed internally by the college/university, systems available through professional associations or private vendor-based systems. **3**

93. Career services offices make informed decisions based upon its mission, budget, and staffing regarding the use of an array of additional technologically based applications to career services including:

- a. client registration system **3**
- b. client contact, record, and tracking systems **3**
- c. career portfolios **N/E**
- d. graduating student surveys **3**
- e. career fair management systems **3**
- f. resume writing software **N/E**
- g. office intranet sites **N/E**
- h. e-based career advising or counseling **N/E**
- i. video-based technology. **3**

94. Adequate funds are available to support the hardware and software associated with the use of any technological applications to career services. **3**

95. Computer access and/or work stations are available to staff and clients in support of technological applications to career services. **3**

96. Adequate staff support are available to maintain and update the technological applications to career services. **3**

97. Technological applications to career services ensure client confidentiality and are consistent with legal and ethical standards. Data security and privacy of student records adhere to the institutional privacy policy. **3**

Scoring - Section VII

Number of Items = 17 Possible Score = 51

Number of Applicable Items = **13**

Actual Score = **39**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS:

## **Evaluation Workbook Section VIII: Campus and External Relations**

### VIII. CAMPUS AND EXTERNAL RELATIONS Rating

98. As an integral function within the institution, career services develops and/or maintains productive relationships with relevant campus offices and key stakeholders. **2**

99. Career services develops institutional support for career development and student employment services for students and other designated clients. **3**

100. Career services involves the academic administration and faculty in career planning and employment programs. **3**

101. Career services raises issues and concerns with the institution's legal counsel regarding compliance with employment laws as they pertain to the recruitment and hiring of students and alumni. **3**

102. Career services participates in campus activities such as faculty organizations, committees, student orientation programs, classroom presentations, academic courses in career planning, and student organization programs. **3**

103. Career services exchanges information with the academic administration and faculty concerning employment requirements, labor market trends, specific jobs, and employment that may be related to academic planning and curriculum development. **3**

104. Career services arranges appropriate programs that use the experience and expertise of alumni. **3**

105. Career services establishes cooperative relationships with other offices and services in order to support mutual referrals, exchange of information, sharing of resources, and other program functions. **2**

106. Career services provides information and reports to the academic administration, faculty, and key offices of the institution regarding career-related services for students, employers, and alumni. **3**

107. Career services provides feedback to faculty, administrators, and students on the preparation of graduates for employment and graduate school to aid curriculum development and individual career planning. **3**

108. Career services encourages dialogue among employers, faculty members, and administrators concerning career issues and trends for students and graduates. **3**

109. Career services provides parents with information and relevant data on career education programs and services and key results related to employment and graduate study outcomes for recent graduates. **3**

110. Career services serves as an institutional resource for the media and provides key information and data related to career development, labor market trends, and employment outcomes as appropriate. **3**

111. Career services leadership/management encourages staff to participate in professional associations and community activities related to career and employment issues. **3**

112. Career services participates in professional staff development activities. **3**

Scoring - Section VIII

Number of Items = 15 Possible Score = 45

Number of Applicable Items = **15**

Actual Score = **43**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.86**

**COMMENTS: VII-98. VII-105. *Though very successful cooperative relationships are in place for the majority of the campus there is a notable exception (Business) which provides a challenge for OCS and needs to be addressed. Resolving this issue by OCS is unlikely without intervention and assistance from student affairs and academic administration.***

## **Evaluation Workbook Section IX: Employer Relations and Recruitment Services**

### **IX. EMPLOYER RELATIONS AND RECRUITMENT SERVICES Rating**

113. Each career services office develops policies and practices for employer relations and services. **3**

114. Career services develops strategic objectives for employer services and job development that yield maximum opportunities for the institution's students and alumni. **3**

115. Career services develops and maintains relationships with employers who may provide career development and employment opportunities for students and alumni. **3**

116. Career services enhances customer service and fosters continuous improvement by using feedback from employers on key performance indicators and measures of services, e.g., candidate hiring rates, cost-per-hire, satisfaction with service, etc. **3**

117. Career services informs, educates, and consults with employers on the nature of services it provides and student candidates available. **3**

118. Career services involves employers in programs that meet students' career and employment needs. **3**

119. Career services promotes employer adherence to professional and ethical standards. **3**

120. Career services provides employer feedback to faculty, administrators, and students on the preparation of students for jobs, the curricula, and the hiring process. **3**

121. Career services develops and implements marketing strategies to cultivate employment opportunities for students. **3**

122. Career services maximizes opportunities for employers to consider candidates for employment. **3**

123. Career services maximizes students' exposure to employers, while respecting institutional academic and co-curricular standards. **3**

124. Career services encourages dialogue among employers, faculty, and the institution's administrators concerning career and employment issues. **3**

125. Career services facilitates employer involvement and communication with faculty,

students, and administrators. **3**

126. Career services does not give preferential treatment to specific employers and should treat all employers uniformly and consistently. **3**

127. Career services understands the variety of needs and employment practices among small businesses, large corporations, government, and nonprofit organizations. **3**

128. Career services defines the types of employers they will serve and articulates policies that guide the working relationships with various types of employers. **3**

129. Career services offers a variety of services to employers that reflect student interests and employer needs, e.g., campus recruiting, resume referrals, job listings, internships, etc. **3**

130. Career services provides information to employers regarding the institution's operations, student profile, academic programs and curricula, enrollments, and academic calendar. **3**

131. Career services provides information to employers regarding policies and procedures; interviewing logistics; instructions for using services; and information that may assist the recruiter in visiting campus, e.g., lodging information, maps, parking sites, etc. **3**

132. Career services encourages employer participation in career planning courses, career conferences, career and alumni fairs, cooperative education, and internships. **3**

133. Career services provides information and services to assist recruiters and graduate school representatives to effectively communicate their opportunities to specific and targeted student populations **3**

134. Career services encourages employers to list job vacancies with the career services office on a continuing basis and to provide the office with information concerning job offers, salaries, and hires. **3**

135. In coordination with the institution's development office, career services encourages employer support of the institution, which may include scholarships and other forms of financial support. **N/E**

136. Career services develops policies for working with third-party recruiters, which may include requiring recruiters to disclose the identities of the organizations they are representing and to adhere to the ethical guidelines documented in the NACE Principles for Professional Conduct. **3**

Scoring - Section IX

Number of Items = 24 Possible Score = 72

Number of Applicable Items = **23**

Actual Score = **69**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS:

## **Evaluation Workbook Section X: Legal Responsibilities**

### **X. LEGAL RESPONSIBILITIES Rating**

137. Career services professionals are knowledgeable about accepted and current professional practices and are responsive to those obligations and limitations imposed on the operation of their program areas by relevant civil and criminal laws, institutional policies, and any contractual commitments. **3**

138. The institution provides career services professional staff with access to legal advice as needed to carry out their assigned responsibilities. **3**

139. The institution informs career services in a timely fashion about extraordinary or changing legal obligations and potential liabilities. **N/E**

140. Career services ensures that records are maintained following prevailing ethical and legal guidelines. **3**

141. Career services staff are in compliance with the Family Education Rights and Privacy Act regarding disclosure of student information contained in education records. **3**

142. Career services staff are in compliance with laws regarding the privacy of data maintained in electronic form by the career center or by another entity acting at its request. **3**

143. Career services staff are in compliance with defamation laws regarding references and



recommendations on the behalf of students. **3**

144. Career services staff are in compliance with equal employment opportunity laws regarding employment referral practices. **3**

145. Career services staff are in compliance with affirmative action regulations and laws. **3**

146. Career services staff are in compliance with liability issues pertaining to experiential learning programs. **N/E**

147. Career services staff are in compliance with work authorization practices in countries other than where the student holds citizenship. **N/E**

148. Career services staff are in compliance with institutional policies regarding safety standards and practices for students traveling to work or participating in university-sponsored experiential activities. **N/E**

149. Career services staff are in compliance with laws governing services provided by outside vendors. **N/E**

150. Career services staff are in compliance with laws regarding grant applications. **N/E**

151. Career services staff are in compliance with laws regarding eligibility to work in the United States. **N/E**

152. Career services staff are in compliance with any other state or federal employment or relevant student-related statute. **N/E**

153. Career services staff use appropriate policies and practices to protect students and to limit the liability exposure of the institution and its officers, employees, and agents. **3**

Scoring - Section X  
 Number of Items = 17 Possible Score = 51  
 Number of Applicable Items = **9**  
 Actual Score = **27**  
 Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**  
 COMMENTS:

**Evaluation Workbook Section XI: Equal Opportunity, Access, Affirmative Action, and Diversity**

XI. EQUAL OPPORTUNITY, ACCESS, AFFIRMATIVE ACTION, AND DIVERSITY Rating

154. Career services adheres to the spirit and intent of equal opportunity laws in all activities. **3**

155. Career services' operating policies and procedures do not discriminate on the basis of race, color, religion, age, national origin, gender, sexual orientation, disability, marital status, or veteran status. **3**

156. Career services' programs, services, events, and facilities are accessible to all students. **2**

157. Career services' hours of operation respond to the needs of all students. **3**

158. Career services seeks to identify, prevent, and/or remedy any discriminatory practices associated with the delivery of its services. **3**

159. Career services staff serve as advocates by bringing the needs of all students to the attention of the institution's administration. **3**

160. Career services ensures that employers using its services and programs adhere to the word and spirit of equal employment opportunity and affirmative action. **3**

161. Career services staff make every effort to educate faculty members about legal and ethical issues relating to student referrals and recommendations. **3**

162. Career services works in conjunction with the institution's special services and related organizations to enhance student and employer awareness and appreciation of cultural and ethnic differences. **3**

163. Career services provides educational programs that help students from diverse backgrounds and individuals with special needs to identify and address their unique needs related to career development and employment. **3**

164. Career services initiates partnerships and cooperative programming with other offices representing special populations to ensure appropriate service delivery. **3**

Scoring - Section XI  
 Number of Items = 11 Possible Score = 33

Number of Applicable Items = 11

Actual Score = **32**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.9**

COMMENTS:

### **Evaluation Workbook Section XII: Ethics**

#### XII. ETHICS Rating

165. All persons involved in the delivery of career services to students maintain the highest standards of ethical behavior as set forth in the "Career Services Professions" section of the NACE Principles for Professional Conduct as well any additional professional ethical standards and/or codes that may apply. **3**

166. Career services leaders/managers provide guidance and education on ethical standards to all persons involved in providing career services. **3**

Scoring - Section XII

Number of Items = 2 Possible Score = 6

Number of Applicable Items = **2**

Actual Score = **6**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **3**

COMMENTS:

### **Evaluation Workbook Section XIII: Program Evaluation, Assessment, and Research**

#### XIII. PROGRAM EVALUATION, ASSESSMENT, AND RESEARCH Rating

167. Career services conducts systematic qualitative and quantitative evaluations of its program quality in order to determine whether and to what degree its stated mission and goals are being met. **2**

168. Although methods of assessment vary, a sufficient range of measures are employed to maintain objectivity and comprehensiveness in program evaluation. **3**

169. Data collected includes responses from students, employers, and other constituencies. **3**

170. Results of these evaluations are used in revising and improving programs, services, and staff performance. **3**

171. Institutions use accepted methods of program evaluation, such as those in The NACE Sourcebook for Conducting Evaluations and Measurements of Career Services. **3**

172. Career services offices collaborate with institutional research, state agencies, accrediting bodies, academic graduate programs, and other evaluative groups that generate and assess evaluation information. **3**

173. Evaluations may include:

a. review of the mission, goals, programs, and services; **3**

b. quantitative program user data; **3**

c. career services wide-qualitative feedback survey; **3**

d. program-specific quantitative assessment; **3**

e. program-specific qualitative assessment; **3**

f. systematic needs-based assessments to guide program development; **3**

g. first destination surveys at or following graduation and/or alumni surveys; **3**

h. inter-institutional benchmarks, and other comparative data to evaluate program effectiveness and efficiency; **3**

i. empirically based outcome research and/or evidence of client learner outcomes. **2**

174. Career services prepares and disseminates annual and special reports, including goals and objectives, current programs and services, service delivery information, first destination information, and/or graduate follow-up information. **3**

175. Career services gathers, participates in, and/or conducts relevant research on career development; academic success; institutional issues such as admissions and retention; student learning; employment trends; and career interests. **2**

Scoring - Section XIII

Number of Items = 17 Possible Score = 51

Number of Applicable Items = 17

Actual Score = **49**

Mean Score (actual score divided by number of applicable items) = **2.88**

COMMENTS: ***The team discovered limited empirically based outcome research and/or evidence of client learner outcomes.***

#### **Evaluation Workbook Section XIV: Overall Program Evaluation Summary**

QUANTITATIVE SCORES SUMMARY:

Number of Applicable Items **275**

Actual Score **794**

Mean Score **2.89**

## APPENDIX B

### Career Services External Review Team Itinerary

Stan Inman: Director of Career Services, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah

Dick Rapp: Associate VP for Student Affairs/Director of Career Services (Emeritus)  
Boise State University, Boise, Idaho

Hotel: Doubletree Edgewater, 100 Madison, 406-728-3 100

#### Wednesday, November 7

4:37pm: Arrive MSO on Delta # 3847 - Mike will pick-up at airport

7:00pm: Dinner

#### Thursday, November 8

8:00-9:00am: Meet with Student Affairs Directors and VP for Student Affairs, UH004 (Mike escort)

9: 15-10:00: Meet with Aine Doherty-Franczyk, Career Services Counseling Intern, EL 154

10:00- 10:15: Break

10:15- 11:00: Meet with Terry Berkhouse, Director of Internship Services, EL 154

11: 15-12:00: Meet with Lori Morin, Assistant Dean, College of Health Professions and  
Biomedical Sciences, SB 335 (Daphne escort)

12:00-1:30: Lunch with Daphne, Heather and Laurie

1:30-2:30: Meet with Dean Bobbi Evans and Marlene Bachmann, Director of Field  
Experiences, School of Education, ED 109 (Laurie escort)

2:30-3:00: Travel to Career Services/Break (Laurie escort)

3:00-3:30: Student: Iris Kelly, Business Major, EL 154

Employer: Linda Shinow, Comptroller of the Currency, 406-690-3045 or 406-657-  
6035

3:30-4:00: Student: Randy Price, Business Major, EL 154

Employer: Carol Berquist, KPMG, 406-247-4317

4:00-4:30: Student: Erin Barr, Pre-Med/Elem. Ed. Major, EL 154  
Employer: Principal John Riddle, Salmon, ID H.S., 208-940-1015 or 208-756-2415

4:30-5:00: Student: Andrew Stickney, Geology Major, EL 154  
Employer: Captain Ian Garvey, U.S. Marine Corps, 509-353-2953

7:00pm: Dinner

**Friday, November 9**

8:00-9:15am: Meet with Career Services Staff, EL 226 (Mike escort)

9:30-10:30: Meet with Teresa Branch, VP for Student Affairs, UH 022 (Mike escort)

10:30-11:00: Meet with Charlie Thorne, Assistant to VP (Budget) and  
Valerie Marsh, Career Services Budget Manager, UH 022 (Cindy escort to GBB)

11:15-12:00: Meet with Teresa Beed, Chair, Masters of Accountancy Program,  
School of Business Administration, GBB 3 15 (Mike escort to COT)

12:00-1:30: Lunch at College of Technology (COT) (Mike, Rowan and Lynn)

1:30-1:50: Meet with Karen Hill, Chair, Applied Arts and Sciences, COT

1:50-2:10: Meet with Lynn Stocking, Associate Dean, COT

2:10-2:40: Meet with Alan Fugleberg, Enrollment Services, COT

2:40-3:00: Meet with Cheryl Galipeau, Faculty Business Technology, COT

3:00-3:30: Meet with Cec Gallagher, Academic Support, COT

3:30-4:00: Travel to Mountain Campus (Rowan escort)

4:00-5:00: Exit Session with Director of Career Services, EL 154

6:00pm: Dinner

**Saturday, November 10**

Dick Rapp and Stan Inman

1:02pm: Leave MSO on Delta # 395 1 - Mike will drop-off at airport